

CARSI Replication Results: Estimation Results from De-identified Models



Results from Published Models and De-identified Models

- The original models described in the published report employed a multi-level model that required the use of community level indicators for random effects. Given that the interviews covered such a small area (i.e, neighborhoods) and given the extremely sensitive of the information (reports on crime, gangs, threats, extortion, etc.) included in the questionnaire in the context of highly violent countries and regions, our obligation to protect the anonymity of respondents is especially high. For this reason, we have removed all indicators below the level of the municipio. Therefore, it is not possible to replicate the exact models in the published analysis. However, we have re-analyzed all the data using a simplified model (a regression without controls and without random or fixed effects) and find very similar results, leading to the same conclusions. As a courtesy to users, we provide these figures and models alongside the original published models for comparison.



r; t=0.00 14:45:13

1 . qui log off newmod

Robberies Model

Model **vicbarlarr**

Source	SS	df	MS			
Model	578413.272	5	115682.654			
Residual	56629081.6	24069	2352.78082			
Total	57207494.9	24074	2376.31864			

Number of obs =	24075
F(5, 24069) =	49.17
Prob > F =	0.0000
R-squared =	0.0101
Adj R-squared =	0.0099
Root MSE =	48.505

vicbarlarr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	1.924575	1.05077	1.83	0.067	-.134999	3.984149
time						
1	2.769057	1.184294	2.34	0.019	.4477657	5.090348
2	-5.715456	1.065321	-5.37	0.000	-7.803552	-3.627361
treatment						
Treated	-7.193862	1.465258	-4.91	0.000	-10.06586	-4.321865
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0	(empty)				
Treated#1	.468774	1.585517	0.30	0.767	-2.638939	3.576487
Treated#2	0	(omitted)				
_cons	41.65621	.7683809	54.21	0.000	40.15014	43.16229

Drug Sales Model

Model **vicbar3arr**

Source	SS	df	MS			
Model	615805.625	5	123161.125			
Residual	38031161.3	21817	1743.18932			
Total	38646967	21822	1771.00939			

Number of obs =	21823
F(5, 21817) =	70.65
Prob > F =	0.0000
R-squared =	0.0159
Adj R-squared =	0.0157
Root MSE =	41.752

vicbar3arr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	-5.178624	.9521288	-5.44	0.000	-7.044866	-3.312382
time						
1	-.1724621	1.07198	-0.16	0.872	-2.273621	1.928697
2	3.527336	.9645749	3.66	0.000	1.636699	5.417973
treatment Treated	-6.728898	1.32602	-5.07	0.000	-9.327993	-4.129803
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	.0483042	1.431828	0.03	0.973	-2.758183	2.854792
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	26.82386	.6953759	38.57	0.000	25.46087	28.18684

Extortion Model

Model **vicbar4arr**

Source	SS	df	MS			
Model	302625.156	5	60525.0311	Number of obs = 22552		
Residual	28242181.1	22546	1252.64708	F(5, 22546) = 48.32		
Total	28544806.2	22551	1265.78893	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0106		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0104		
				Root MSE = 35.393		

vicbar4arr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	10.26813	.7907453	12.99	0.000	8.718215	11.81805
time						
1	2.350811	.9001282	2.61	0.009	.5864973	4.115124
2	.8666074	.8019183	1.08	0.280	-.7052079	2.438423
treatment Treated	-9.590647	1.101928	-8.70	0.000	-11.7505	-7.430792
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	2.246048	1.19989	1.87	0.061	-.1058195	4.597915
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	11.38733	.5786561	19.68	0.000	10.25312	12.52154

Murder Model

Model **vicbar7arr**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 23735		
Model	532099.283	5	106419.857	F(5, 23729) = 55.52		
Residual	45481721.7	23729	1916.71464	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0116		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0114		
Total	46013820.9	23734	1938.73013	Root MSE = 43.78		

vicbar7arr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	8.888138	.9546634	9.31	0.000	7.016936	10.75934
time						
1	3.655042	1.083884	3.37	0.001	1.530561	5.779523
2	3.325163	.9710074	3.42	0.001	1.421926	5.228399
treatment						
Treated	-17.11238	1.330476	-12.86	0.000	-19.7202	-14.50457
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	11.16033	1.444777	7.72	0.000	8.32848	13.99219
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	23.56263	.7014056	33.59	0.000	22.18783	24.93743

Perc of Insecurity Model

Model **pese0r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25139		
Model	127361.785	5	25472.3569	F(5, 25133) = 40.73		
Residual	15718639.6	25133	625.418358	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0080		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0078		
Total	15846001.4	25138	630.360465	Root MSE = 25.008		

pese0r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	-2.358539	.5267645	-4.48	0.000	-3.391028	-1.32605
time						
1	1.994706	.5867994	3.40	0.001	.8445453	3.144867
2	2.952083	.5365799	5.50	0.000	1.900355	4.003811
treatment						
Treated	-1.758878	.7407318	-2.37	0.018	-3.210755	-.3070002
treatment#time						

Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	-1.478856	.7990477	-1.85	0.064	-3.045037	.0873236
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	40.84311	.3823981	106.81	0.000	40.09359	41.59264

Perc of Insecurity when walking alone Model

Model **fear4r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25115		
Model	70858.6723	5	14171.7345	F(5, 25109) = 14.61		
Residual	24353855.7	25109	969.925353	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0029		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0027		
				Root MSE = 31.144		
Total	24424714.4	25114	972.553729			

fear4r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	3.896139	.6567348	5.93	0.000	2.608901	5.183378
time						
1	4.884655	.7316128	6.68	0.000	3.450651	6.318659
2	3.59889	.6685707	5.38	0.000	2.288452	4.909328
treatment						
Treated	-5.579179	.9228098	-6.05	0.000	-7.38794	-3.770417
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	1.459449	.9954308	1.47	0.143	-.4916535	3.410551
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	51.40632	.4766013	107.86	0.000	50.47216	52.34049

Youth Loitering Model

Model **diso7r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25168		
Model	56309.1622	5	11261.8324	F(5, 25162) = 12.90		
Residual	21962140.4	25162	872.829678	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0026		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0024		
				Root MSE = 29.544		
Total	22018449.5	25167	874.893691			

diso7r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	4.502146	.6221502	7.24	0.000	3.282695	5.721596
time						
1	3.331173	.691907	4.81	0.000	1.974995	4.687351
2	2.967299	.6335915	4.68	0.000	1.725423	4.209175
treatment Treated	-5.787724	.8749798	-6.61	0.000	-7.502736	-4.072713
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	-.7000084	.9428504	-0.74	0.458	-2.54805	1.148033
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	59.72806	.4513776	132.32	0.000	58.84333	60.61278

Youth in Gangs Model

Model **diso8r**

Source	SS	df	MS			
Model	166105.066	5	33221.0133	Number of obs = 24769		
Residual	25001904.5	24763	1009.64764	F(5, 24763) = 32.90		
Total	25168009.6	24768	1016.15026	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0066		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0064		
				Root MSE = 31.775		

diso8r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	4.079776	.6716419	6.07	0.000	2.763317	5.396234
time						
1	1.092485	.7480977	1.46	0.144	-.3738313	2.558801
2	5.624593	.6893773	8.16	0.000	4.273372	6.975813
treatment Treated	-8.85558	.9497945	-9.32	0.000	-10.71723	-6.993926
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	1.442286	1.023661	1.41	0.159	-.564151	3.448723
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	55.42891	.4871191	113.79	0.000	54.47412	56.38369

Gang fights Model

Model **disol8r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 24836		
Model	291746.994	5	58349.3988	F(5, 24830) = 50.87		
Residual	28479229.5	24830	1146.96857	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0101		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0099		
Total	28770976.5	24835	1158.48506	Root MSE = 33.867		

disol8r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	1.277515	.7164181	1.78	0.075	-.1267071	2.681737
time						
1	-1.443864	.7962892	-1.81	0.070	-3.004639	.1169098
2	1.357386	.7350678	1.85	0.065	-.0833904	2.798163
treatment						
Treated	-6.883852	1.011741	-6.80	0.000	-8.866926	-4.900779
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	-1.368247	1.088157	-1.26	0.209	-3.5011	.7646065
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	48.64849	.5203527	93.49	0.000	47.62857	49.66841

Avoid walking in dangerous areas Model

Model **fear10rr**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25014		
Model	500182.738	5	100036.548	F(5, 25008) = 42.02		
Residual	59540212.6	25008	2380.84663	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0083		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0081		
Total	60040395.4	25013	2400.36762	Root MSE = 48.794		

fear10rr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	12.7221	1.028905	12.36	0.000	10.70539	14.73882
time						
1	11.29875	1.151134	9.82	0.000	9.042462	13.55504
2	9.703218	1.047776	9.26	0.000	7.649517	11.75692
treatment						
Treated	-18.56129	1.447363	-12.82	0.000	-21.3982	-15.72437
treatment#time						

Treated#0	0	(empty)				
Treated#1	1.24729	1.565281	0.80	0.426	-1.820752	4.315333
Treated#2	0	(omitted)				
_cons	32.75539	.7468846	43.86	0.000	31.29145	34.21933

Community Organized to prevent crime Model

Model **soco9r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 24643		
Model	323940.975	5	64788.1949	F(5, 24637) = 70.79		
Residual	22547525.3	24637	915.189563	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0142		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0140		
				Root MSE = 30.252		
Total	22871466.2	24642	928.149754			

soco9r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	-.8164182	.648589	-1.26	0.208	-2.087692	.4548553
time						
1	6.230115	.7161337	8.70	0.000	4.82645	7.63378
2	-2.413524	.6567907	-3.67	0.000	-3.700873	-1.126174
treatment						
Treated	6.269713	.9072142	6.91	0.000	4.491518	8.047907
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0	(empty)				
Treated#1	-3.8479	.9714514	-3.96	0.000	-5.752003	-1.943797
Treated#2	0	(omitted)				
_cons	42.13715	.4709104	89.48	0.000	41.21413	43.06016

Trust in Police Model

Model **b18r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25045		
Model	149361.871	5	29872.3743	F(5, 25039) = 28.95		
Residual	25832551.3	25039	1031.69261	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0057		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0056		
				Root MSE = 32.12		
Total	25981913.2	25044	1037.45062			

bl8r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	-.9161056	.6795006	-1.35	0.178	-2.247967	.4157555
time						
1	2.216686	.7543499	2.94	0.003	.7381156	3.695256
2	-2.381264	.689835	-3.45	0.001	-3.733381	-1.029147
treatment Treated	3.547445	.9537745	3.72	0.000	1.677991	5.416899
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	.6571344	1.026471	0.64	0.522	-1.354809	2.669078
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	45.572	.4922926	92.57	0.000	44.60708	46.53692

Sat w/ Police Model

Model **pole2r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 24528		
Model	65659.13	5	13131.826	F(5, 24522) =	23.10	
Residual	13941580.5	24522	568.533584	Prob > F =	0.0000	
Total	14007239.7	24527	571.094699	R-squared =	0.0047	
				Adj R-squared =	0.0045	
				Root MSE =	23.844	

pole2r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps Treatment	.5818037	.5075475	1.15	0.252	-.4130202	1.576628
time						
1	.6265999	.5654418	1.11	0.268	-.4817005	1.7349
2	.385362	.5170929	0.75	0.456	-.6281716	1.398896
treatment Treated	1.938292	.7151555	2.71	0.007	.5365437	3.34004
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	1.476082	.7715754	1.91	0.056	-.0362522	2.988417
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	46.78522	.3675264	127.30	0.000	46.06485	47.5056

Interpersonal Trust Model

Model **it1r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25018		
Model	70164.9518	5	14032.9904	F(5, 25012) = 19.36		
Residual	18132466.8	25012	724.950695	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0039		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0037		
Total	18202631.7	25017	727.610494	Root MSE = 26.925		

it1r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	-0.0957857	.5694326	-0.17	0.866	-1.211907	1.020336
time						
1	-3.406561	.6330654	-5.38	0.000	-4.647407	-2.165715
2	-4.149098	.5790381	-7.17	0.000	-5.284046	-3.014149
treatment						
Treated	1.846101	.799774	2.31	0.021	.2784968	3.413705
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	1.417728	.8614974	1.65	0.100	-.270858	3.106313
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	58.65672	.412718	142.12	0.000	57.84777	59.46567

Sat w/ Demo Model

Model **pn4r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 24648		
Model	47823.0699	5	9564.61397	F(5, 24642) = 18.23		
Residual	12926209.5	24642	524.560082	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0037		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0035		
Total	12974032.6	24647	526.393988	Root MSE = 22.903		

pn4r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	-2.95313	.4894932	-6.03	0.000	-3.912566	-1.993694
time						
1	-1.636216	.5419074	-3.02	0.003	-2.698387	-.5740443
2	-2.014741	.4963572	-4.06	0.000	-2.987631	-1.041851
treatment						
Treated	2.931033	.6861059	4.27	0.000	1.586224	4.275842
treatment#time						

Treated#0	0	(empty)				
Treated#1	2.870812	.736746	3.90	0.000	1.426746	4.314879
Treated#2	0	(omitted)				
_cons	47.37677	.3544618	133.66	0.000	46.682	48.07153

Govt handling of security Model

Model **nllr**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 24940		
Model	512096.754	5	102419.351	F(5, 24934) = 129.94		
Residual	19653844.6	24934	788.234725	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0254		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0252		
				Root MSE = 28.076		
Total	20165941.4	24939	808.610665			

nllr	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	2.742903	.5965113	4.60	0.000	1.573706	3.912101
time						
1	10.12857	.6605345	15.33	0.000	8.833881	11.42325
2	6.203044	.6047532	10.26	0.000	5.017692	7.388396
treatment						
Treated	-.6843235	.8362155	-0.82	0.413	-2.323355	.9547083
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0	(empty)				
Treated#1	1.867587	.8977359	2.08	0.038	.1079714	3.627202
Treated#2	0	(omitted)				
_cons	38.24644	.4321869	88.50	0.000	37.39933	39.09356

Perc of Insecurity when walking alone Model

Model **fear4r**

Source	SS	df	MS	Number of obs = 25115		
Model	70858.6723	5	14171.7345	F(5, 25109) = 14.61		
Residual	24353855.7	25109	969.925353	Prob > F = 0.0000		
				R-squared = 0.0029		
				Adj R-squared = 0.0027		
				Root MSE = 31.144		
Total	24424714.4	25114	972.553729			

fear4r	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf. Interval]	
treat_contr_grps						
Treatment	3.896139	.6567348	5.93	0.000	2.608901	5.183378
time						
1	4.884655	.7316128	6.68	0.000	3.450651	6.318659
2	3.59889	.6685707	5.38	0.000	2.288452	4.909328
treatment						
Treated	-5.579179	.9228098	-6.05	0.000	-7.38794	-3.770417
treatment#time						
Treated#0	0 (empty)					
Treated#1	1.459449	.9954308	1.47	0.143	-.4916535	3.410551
Treated#2	0 (omitted)					
_cons	51.40632	.4766013	107.86	0.000	50.47216	52.34049